
Penderfyniad ar yr Apêl

Ymweliad â safle a wnaed ar 06/02/17

gan Joanne Burston BSc MA MRTPI

Arolygydd a benodir gan Weinidogion Cymru

Dyddiad: 17.02.2017

Appeal Decision

Site visit made on 06/02/17

by Joanne Burston BSc MA MRTPI

an Inspector appointed by the Welsh Ministers

Date: 17.02.2017

Appeal Ref: APP/E6840/D/17/3167426

Site address: 1 Chapel Road, Abergavenny NP7 7DN

The Welsh Ministers have transferred the authority to decide this appeal to me as the appointed Inspector.

- The appeal is made under section 78 of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990 against a refusal to grant planning permission.
 - The appeal is made by Miss Kelly Evans against the decision of Monmouthshire County Council.
 - The application Ref DC/2016/01194, dated 16 October 2016, was refused by notice dated 15 December 2016.
 - The development proposed is the conversion of loft space above existing garage to create a home gym and office, including the installation of two dormer roof windows.
-

Decision

1. The appeal is dismissed.

Procedural Matters

2. I have considered the duty to improve the economic, social, environmental and cultural well-being of Wales, in accordance with the sustainable development principle, under section 3 of the Well-Being of Future Generations (Wales) Act 2015 ("the WBFG Act"). In reaching this decision, I have taken into account the ways of working set out at section 5 of the WBFG Act and I consider that this decision is consistent with the sustainable development principle as required by section 8 of the WBFG Act.

Main Issue

3. The main issue in this case is the effect of the proposed development on the character and appearance of the Abergavenny Conservation Area having particular regard to the statutory test to pay special attention to the desirability of preserving or enhancing its character or appearance.

Reasons

4. The site lies within the Abergavenny Conservation Area. There is a duty imposed by Section 72(1) of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990 requiring decision makers to have special regard to the desirability of preserving or enhancing the character or appearance of a Conservation Area.
 5. The Abergavenny Conservation Area covers a large area, comprising the historic core town centre, Victorian/Edwardian Monmouth Road entrance, the 19th century high
-

density development to the immediate north of the town centre, Castle Meadows, and the 19th and early 20th century development to the northern suburbs. The appeal site is situated in the 'Brecon Road' character area, which is one of the principal routes from and to the town. The line of the street is well defined by boundary treatments, walls and railings or built form. This provides good enclosure for most of the street. Furthermore, this part of the Conservation Area is noted for its diverse use and survival of traditional materials.

6. The garage, which is the subject of this appeal, is located on a prominent corner plot on the junction of Brecon Road and Chapel Road. However, a boundary fence and a tall mature conifer hedge screen the majority of it from public view. Nevertheless, the roof of the garage is visible from the public highway and many surrounding properties.
7. The proposed development includes two dormer windows, located on the roof plane facing Brecon Road. From the drawings before me the dormers would have a flat roof, box like construction, clad in mahogany effect UPVC shiplap cladding. They would occupy a significant proportion of the roof slope on which they are proposed to be located leaving little of the original roof visible above or below it. Moreover their box-like form would be neither sympathetic nor subsidiary to the modest scale and appearance of the existing garage.
8. From public viewpoints the garage would adopt an ungainly appearance brought about as a result of the scale, bulk and design of the proposed dormer windows. The garage would become a bold feature in the street scene, rather than its current status as a subservient building in a garden.
9. Overall the proposal would not be conducive to preserving or enhancing the character and appearance or the important local aesthetic of the Brecon Road character area as described above. In consequence it would fail to preserve the character or appearance of the Abergavenny Conservation Area.
10. I appreciate that there are other dormer extensions within the local area but I am not aware of their full background. In any event, their existence does not provide justification for further harm to the Conservation Area.
11. Although I sympathize with the appellant's situation and her need for additional accommodation, personal circumstances are rarely such that they outweigh more general planning considerations and it is likely that the development would remain long after the current personal circumstances cease to be material.
12. To conclude on this main issue, the proposal would be contrary to Policies HE1 and DES1 of the Monmouthshire Local Development Plan. These seek, amongst other matters, to ensure that development is of high quality design which respects local character and preserves or enhances the character or appearance of the Conservation Area.

Overall Conclusion

13. I have considered all other matters raised but none outweigh the conclusions I have reached and the appeal is dismissed.

Joanne Burston

INSPECTOR